

HPC

**Historic Preservation Commission
Monroe County
Application for Special Certificate of Appropriateness
April 5, 2021**

Revised Staff Report

187 Atlantic Circle Drive

BARRY ROLAND HOFFMAN (File #2020-207) is seeking approval to replace the existing one story flat roof with a two story gable V-crimp roof and dormers at 187 Atlantic Circle Drive, within the Tavernier Historic District, Monroe County, Florida, having Real Estate Number 00556300-000000 and legally described as:

East 20 Feet of Lot 12 and West 30 Feet of Lot 13, Block E, TAVERNIER 2, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 2-8, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida.

History and Architecture of the Building

This is a flat-roofed, masonry vernacular structure built around 1952 according to the Property Appraiser's records. In the "Monroe County Cultural Resource Assessment Update" (2016) it was recorded in the Florida Master Site File as eligible, as a contributor to the locally designated Tavernier Historic District and as appearing to meet the criteria for National Register listing as part of a district. This application was continued at the HPC meeting held on February 1, 2021. At that time it was determined that the property is considered as non-contributing as it was never approved by the BOCC.

Relevant Standards and Guidelines: From the Tavernier Historic District Preservation Guidelines:

Roof Shape (p.23)

The intent is to preserve the roof configuration of existing buildings and to direct new development to build roofs that are compatible with the character of the district.

Non-Contributing Structures: Additions in the residential areas should have sloped roofs. Sloped roofs can be hipped or gabled and may have dormers as long as these are structurally and spatially integrated to the building.

Roofing Materials (p.24)

The intent is to keep a uniformity of roofing materials in the district.

Non-Contributing Structures: Roofing materials include standing seam metal, v-crimp, stamped metal, and composition tile.

Dormers (p.27)

The intent is to allow the use of dormers when they are an integral part of the building.

Non-Contributing Structures: Dormers are allowed when they are structurally and spatially integrated with the building.

From the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards* (p.9)

Standard 9: "New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment."

Standard 10: "New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired."

Analysis:

Note: On the third page of the blueprint set, the rear elevation is mistakenly labelled as the front elevation.

The existing flat roofed structure is 9'10" in height. This proposal is to increase the height of this approximately 900 square foot structure to 24'6". This is a complex roof plan on a modest house, but does not appear to go against the guidelines for non-contributing structures. The applicant should clarify if the gazebo is included in this proposed project.

The proposed project will not have a direct negative effect on other nearby historic properties. However, it will be a loss to the Historic District as its' own historic integrity will be destroyed.

Diane E. Silvia, Historic Florida Keys Foundation