

PLANNING COMMISSION
December 20, 2017
Meeting Minutes

The Planning Commission of Monroe County conducted a meeting on **Wednesday, December 20, 2017**, beginning at 10:00 a.m. at the Marathon Government Center, 2798 Overseas Highway, Marathon, Florida.

CALL TO ORDER

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

ROLL CALL by Ilze Aguila

PLANNING COMMISSION MEMBERS

Denise Werling	Absent
William Wiatt, Chair	Present
Teri Johnston	Present
Ron Miller	Present
Beth Ramsay-Vickrey	Present

STAFF

Mayte Santamaria, Sr. Director of Planning and Environmental Resources	Present
Steve Williams, Assistant County Attorney	Present
Peter Morris, Assistant County Attorney	Present
John Wolfe, Planning Commission Counsel	Present
Mike Roberts, Senior Administrator, Environmental Resources	Present
Emily Schemper, Comprehensive Planning Manager	Present
Kevin Bond, Planning & Development Review Manager	Present
Martine Vray, Principal Planner	Present
Ilze Aguila, Sr. Planning Commission Coordinator	Present

COUNTY RESOLUTION 131-92 APPELLANT TO PROVIDE RECORD FOR APPEAL

County Resolution 131-92 was read into the record by Mr. Wolfe. After which, Mr. Wolfe announced that there are only four Commissioners present today so if any applicants want to continue because of the lack of a Commissioner, that is allowed. There were no continuances requested.

SUBMISSION OF PROPERTY POSTING AFFIDAVITS AND PHOTOGRAPHS

Ms. Aguila confirmed receipt of all necessary paperwork.

SWEARING OF COUNTY STAFF

County staff members were sworn in by Mr. Wolfe.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion: Commissioner Ramsay-Vickrey made a motion to approve the November 15, 2017, meeting minutes. Commissioner Johnston seconded the motion. There was no opposition. The motion passed unanimously.

CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

Chair Wiatt stated there had been a request to hear Item 2 first. There was no opposition to that change.

MEETING

New Items:

2. ALFREDO'S COUNTRY KITCHEN DBA ALFREDO'S COOKHOUSE, 102250 OVERSEAS HIGHWAY, KEY LARGO, MILE MARKER 102 BAY SIDE: A PUBLIC HEARING CONCERNING THE REQUEST FOR A 6COP SFS ALCOHOLIC BEVERAGE USE PERMIT, WHICH WOULD ALLOW FOR BEER, WINE, AND LIQUOR, FOR SALE BY THE DRINK FOR CONSUMPTION ON PREMISES ONLY. THE SUBJECT PROPERTY IS LEGALLY DESCRIBED AS LOTS 6, 7 & 8, SECTION 22, TOWNSHIP 61 SOUTH, RANGE 39 EAST, KEY LARGO, MONROE COUNTY, FLORIDA; HAVING REAL ESTATE #00086730-000000.
(FILE 2017-122)

(10:05 a.m.) Ms. Martine Vray, Principal Planner, presented the staff report. This is a request for a 6COP SFS Alcoholic Beverage Special Use Permit which would allow for beer, wine and liquor for sale by the drink and for consumption on the premises only. The site location is on the west side of Overseas Highway in Key Largo. The front part of the property is zoned commercial and the back part is zoned natural. There are several restaurants within 500 feet of this site. The building in which the restaurant is located was constructed in 1973 as a 3600 square foot building for the former Ranch House restaurant chain. The restaurant use continued through 2009, at which time interior renovations were done to convert the restaurant to a restaurant and bar. Staff found a Florida DBPR application for a 2COP alcoholic beverage license dated 1983. The assistant building official provided local approval for the application. On October 19, 2010, the County Commission adopted Resolution Number P38-10 to approve the request by Dennis Duran, DBA Dean Hooker Sports Bar and Grill for a 5COP SRX which is for restaurant, no package sales. Staff recommends approval of the requested 6COP SFS Alcoholic Beverage Special Use Permit with the following conditions: Alcohol service, sales and consumption shall occur only within areas allowed for such use and approved by the Monroe County Planning and Environmental Resources Department. This approval shall apply only to the existing interior area of the restaurant. In the event the DBPR license expires and lapses, the approval shall be null and void as of that date. Approval by the Planning Commission shall be required to renew this permit. Valid objections from surrounding property owners may lead to reevaluation of suggested conditions. These permits issued by virtue of Section 3-6 of the Monroe County Code shall be deemed to be a privilege running with the land. The sale of the real property shall automatically vest the purchase; therefore, all rights and obligations originally granted or imposed to or on the applicant and such privilege may not be separated from the fee simple interest in the realty.

Chair Wiatt asked for questions from staff. There were none. Chair Wiatt asked if the applicant would like to address the Commission. There was no response. Chair Wiatt then asked for public comment. There was none. Public input was closed.

Motion: Commissioner Miller made a motion to approve the request. Commissioner Ramsey-Vickrey seconded the motion. There was no opposition. Motion passed unanimously.

1. QUARRY PARTNERS, LLC, VACANT LAND, BIG COPPITT KEY, MILE MARKER 9.5 GULF SIDE: A PUBLIC HEARING CONCERNING A REQUEST FOR A DEVELOPMENT AGREEMENT BETWEEN MONROE COUNTY AND QUARRY PARTNERS, LLC. THE REQUESTED AGREEMENT RELATES TO THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF 208 ATTACHED RESIDENTIAL DWELLING UNITS DESIGNATED AS AFFORDABLE HOUSING UNITS AT A PROPOSED DENSITY OF 17.3 UNITS PER BUILDABLE ACRE. NO STRUCTURES WILL BE HIGHER THAN 35 FEET. THE SUBJECT PROPERTY IS DESCRIBED AS A PARCEL OF LAND IN SECTION 21, TOWNSHIP 67 SOUTH, RANGE 26 EAST, BIG COPPITT KEY, MONROE COUNTY, FLORIDA, HAVING REAL ESTATE NUMBERS 00120940-000100, 00120940-000201 AND 00120940-000302.
(FILE 2017-215)

(10:11 a.m.) Mr. John Wolfe brought to the Commission's attention that a number of items had been received past the normal deadline requiring all items be submitted five days prior to the hearing. Therefore, the Commission must vote as to whether these documents would be allowed in. Additionally, because these items were submitted late, staff was unable to amend and revise the staff report, but will be commenting orally.

Commissioner Miller asked how that would work if the Commission decided not to accept the new traffic study. Mr. Steve Williams responded that if it were not accepted at this meeting, it would be continued to next month. Commissioner Miller stated that this project had been in the works for many years, yet there was a vote by the BOCC two days ago to change the development agreement, and to add an easement for a \$1.5 million road. Ms. Santamaria stated she did not know what he was referring to. Commissioner Miller added that this item should not be pressured through without the Planning Commission being able to read and study this proposal and he does not feel comfortable doing this. Chair Wiatt said this topic is what was about to be discussed.

Mr. Wolfe further stated that the new items submitted were the new traffic study from December of 2017; a new December 14, 2017 revised Development Agreement, both redline and clean versions; a new ingress and egress easement agreement; public items that had been received; the traffic consultant's response to comments on the traffic impact study; and, revised plans received on December 19, 2017; preliminary comments from Judy Clarke and Vivek Reddy; and a new Interdevelopment and Operating Agreement. Additionally, letters were received from the Mayor of Key West and Commissioner Wardlow to be considered as well. Mr. Wolfe explained that the Commission's task is to decide whether they want these items to be allowed in to be heard and, if

not, the item could be continued but that the attorney for the applicant also wanted to address the issue.

Mr. Bart Smith on behalf of the applicant indicated that he understands Commissioner Miller's apprehension regarding the late-submitted documents, though clarified that these documents were actually not new. The original application submitted to and reviewed by DRC provided this access point which is now the sole access point. Based on staff comments, the Fourth Street access point failed so the applicant removed the Fourth Street access point. The traffic report was then updated removing Fourth Street and having only the Calle Uno access point. All of the documents submitted were only redacting the access point that would have gone through Big Coppitt. Traffic instead goes through Rockland. The original traffic report submitted in April examined Calle Uno and indicated a Level of Service D. The traffic report submitted in November was solely sending the traffic to Fourth Street. This information had been presented to the public at DRC and at the community participation meeting.

Commissioner Miller read from County Engineer Judy Clarke's letter stating, "I reviewed the revised plans that were submitted. They show the proposed access road and new connection to U.S. 1, but do not show Calle Uno, Calle Dos, and the existing connection to U.S. 1 with the right-turn modification so I'm not able to review or provide comments on that." Commissioner Miller continued that the Commission should not be taking the place of the County Engineer by agreeing with this. Mr. Smith added that there would be another two hearings on ingress and egress. Commissioner Miller asked how the Planning Commission could make a good recommendation to move this forward. Mr. Smith suggested leaving it subject to the final approval of ingress and egress by the County Commission. Commissioner Miller stated that this was not acceptable to him. Mr. Smith understood, stating he was entitled to that position, and that he would take any questions from the Commission. There were none for the applicant.

Commissioner Johnston asked staff if it would be reasonable for the Commission to hammer out all of the changes submitted two days ago and make a transparent decision. Ms. Mayte Santamaria responded that she believed so, that the changes made were to address comments in the staff report. Commissioner Johnston then asked if the changes could be addressed from the information in the traffic study before the Commission. Ms. Santamaria responded affirmatively, adding that staff had some preliminary reviews included.

Motion: Commissioner Ramsay-Vickrey made a motion to accept the documents and move forward. Commissioner Johnston seconded the motion. Chair Wiatt asked for a roll call.

Roll Call: Commissioner Ramsay-Vickrey, Yes; Commissioner Johnston, Yes; Commissioner Miller, No; Vice-Chair Wiatt, Yes.

Chair Wiatt asked the Commission if anyone desired additional time to go over anything. Commissioner Miller reiterated that he needed until the next meeting, that this was the bum's rush after five years. Chair Wiatt believed there was a sense of urgency based on the present situation. Commissioner Miller stated the project would take years to build and did not believe it had anything to do with the hurricane. Commissioner Johnston added that "years to build" has nothing to do with it. They must start one piece at a time and this is a substantial parcel to start

with. Commissioner Miller asked if after five years, they needed to get going at this meeting. Both Commissioner Johnston responded yes. Commissioner Ramsay-Vickrey responded yes, as the affordable housing situation is critical and what has happened in the Lower Keys is devastating. The information was received yesterday and she had spent yesterday reviewing it and made three calls to Ms. Santamaria. If Commissioner Miller needed a short break to review it now and ask staff questions, that could be done. Commissioner Miller responded that she must be joking to think this could be reviewed in a short break. Commissioner Ramsay-Vickrey reiterated that it had been received yesterday. Chair Wiatt stated that three out of four had agreed to continue today and asked for the staff report.

Mr. Wolfe interjected that there had been a request that the Key West Mayor's and Commissioner Wardlow's letters be read into the record. The Commission could decide whether they wanted them read aloud. Chair Wiatt indicated he had read both letters. Commissioner Ramsay-Vickrey opined that for the viewing audience, they should be read into the record since they were coming from another governmental agency. Chair Wiatt asked if there was any opposition. There was none. Commissioner Miller asked if they said, "Hooray for the home team." Mr. Wolfe responded that he didn't want any spoilers, and then read both letters aloud into the record. Both letters ultimately requested that the Planning Commission approve this Development Agreement.

Mr. Kevin Bond, Planning and Development Review Manager, presented the staff report, first going over some background information. The proposed development is for 208 attached residential dwelling units to be designated as affordable housing on a 15-acre site located on Big Coppitt Key, very close to Rockland Key. When completed, the project will be 17.3 units per buildable acre. There will be 474 off-street parking spaces, a clubhouse and pool. The development includes wetland in conservation areas around the property and also involves ingress and egress between the project and U.S. 1. The location is officially Big Coppitt Key. In February 2016, the County approved a Future Land Use Amendment which included a site-specific policy in the Comp Plan called the Big Coppitt Mixed Use Area 1. This is the FLUM amendment that changed the property from Mixed Use Commercial Fishing and Industrial to Mixed Use Commercial. The site-specific policy is what required the Development Agreement being considered today. That policy also includes a requirement that there be a minimum mix of 20 percent low and very low income units and 10 percent median income units. This policy required an evaluation of the ingress and egress of the project. Commissioner Miller asked if the policy read "at least" this many units. Ms. Santamaria responded that that was correct and was Exhibit A to the staff report.

Mr. Bond continued, in December of 2016, the County approved a ROGO reservation of 96 units until December 15, 2017. In September of this year, that reservation was extended to July 1, 2018, and was increased to 104 units, being half of the total project. At the same time, the BOCC approved a second ROGO reservation of 104 units which were from the City of Key West BPAS units, covering the other half of the total units proposed. Mr. Bond then outlined the main points of the proposed Development Agreement itself. This is proposed to be a 10-year agreement, which is the maximum allowed, to complete the project. None of the buildings are proposed higher than 35 feet from existing grade. The agreement outlines the required development permits from the County which includes the Development Agreement itself, a

Major Conditional Use permit, ROGO allocation awards and ultimately building permits. The Development Agreement outlines where these units are coming from; i.e., half from Monroe County ROGO and half from the Key West BPAS units which are available through a 380 Agreement with all of the Keys' municipalities and the State. Those units are reserved until July 1, 2018. Also outlined are the proposed income limits for the 208 units. The County Code requires a 99-year affordable housing deed restriction.

The Development Agreement, as proposed, has this split in two halves; the first 50 years would provide a total of 45 percent very low and low income affordable housing units and 10 percent median income, for a total of just over half of the units being very low, low or median. A minimum mix of 30 percent was required by the Comp Plan. The second remaining half of the deed restriction would be reduced down to 25 percent very low and low and just-under 10 percent median for a total of almost 35 percent affordable housing units out of the total number of units. In exchange for this increased affordable restriction in the first 50 years, building permit fee waivers have been requested. Also, the applicant requested a waiver of wastewater capacity reservation fees which at this point, staff is not recommending. This agreement needs to evaluate the ingress and egress to and from the project and U.S. 1. There have been a lot of changes with regard to this access and several different options evaluated. One has been evaluation of two access routes, one through Big Coppitt and one through Rockland; one providing single access routes through one or the other; and lastly, providing a dedicated access directly to U.S. 1. Each of those has implications for trip generation and level of service on County roads and U.S. 1 intersections. The single access through Big Coppitt created problems with the level of service on Fourth Street and U.S. 1, specifically during the morning commuting hours falling to Level of Service D. There were also problems with the alignment of the intersection of Barcelona and Avenue F where the easement would have been located.

The applicant now is proposing a single access route parallel to Calle Dos on Rockland Key that would connect to Calle Uno and then turn onto U.S. 1. This traffic study shows that with the addition of a right turn lane on Calle Uno, level of service standards would be met for that intersection. Also in the last proposal is a dedicated access parallel to Calle Uno but then connecting to U.S. 1 directly through a driveway with a private easement, which would also have its own right-turn lane. That option would eliminate level of service concerns with any County road. Staff's preliminary review is that this looks favorable, but would still require a full review and have full comments from the Traffic Engineer and the County Engineer. As of the staff memo written on December 11, approval was not recommended based on the level of service concerns with the proposed ingress and egress through Big Coppitt. The latest revision has favorable indications for meeting the level of service concerns.

Chair Wiatt asked the Commission if there were any questions for staff. There were none. Chair Wiatt then asked if the applicant would like to address the Commission.

Mr. Bart Smith gave a power-point presentation showing what the development would look like in 3D, indicating these units would be something the Keys could be proud of. They will not be under-sized dilapidated units which are typical of workforce housing and would keep people in the community. They are two stories over parking. All units have ample parking. There are 474 parking spaces for 208 units. There are nine buildings, eight with 24 units, 12 units per floor,

and the final building will house 16 units. There is a clubhouse adjacent to a pool. There is a gazebo area with an open park area. There are 56 one-bedroom units, all 700 square feet with a 72 square-foot balcony. There are 136 two-bedroom units at 1000 square feet with a 72 square-foot balcony. There are 16 three-bedroom units at 1330 square feet with a 140 square-foot balcony. A couple of units have 540 square-foot balconies. For the first 50 years, a lot of units are going to be at 25 percent of median income; 11 two-bedroom, 1000 square-foot units, at 25 percent of median income, will rent at a rate of \$517 per month; 83 of those units will be at 60 percent of average median income, meaning a two-bedroom unit will rent for \$1242 per month. Commissioner Miller interrupted for clarification, indicating that the chart he had states something different. Mr. Smith clarified that the applicant is agreeing to additional restrictions which further reduce the numbers. The restrictions will be 60 percent and 25 percent due to the ability to have tax credits and the funding requested from the County. The applicant is trying to help every group in affordable housing such as the Sheriff's Office, the hospital and the Public Defender's Office. Housing after the storm is in a dire crisis. Mr. Smith explained that all of the buildings are the same, under 35 feet, two stories over parking, three to four feet above base flood, concrete block new construction meeting all 2018 Building Codes which is stronger than the 2017 currently in place. Mr. Smith then presented the various floor plans.

Mr. Smith proceeded to explain the ingress and egress issues. The original plan had two access points which had been eliminated. The sole access point will be at Second Street and go out directly to U.S. 1. The goal is to not even utilize the County right-of-way. The applicant is in discussions with the property owner to obtain a private right-of-way which exits out onto U.S. 1. This would require sign-off from the property owner and Army Corps permits. Second Street will be used until such time as the requisite easement and approvals are received. This is better for everyone as it will alleviate the traffic concerns of everyone in that neighborhood. Due to these costs and the long private right-of-way, the applicant has asked for some concessions from the County Commission. The first is the building permit fees waiver which the BOCC supports. The second is the capacity reservation fees. Staff is concerned about the effect this would have on the non ad valorem assessment. This won't be resolved today and can be a condition on the applicant and the staff at the discretion of the County Commission as this is not a planning issue.

Commissioner Miller asked if the BOCC had agreed to \$1.5 million. Mr. Smith said that was not true, there had been no meeting and nothing agreed to. The applicant is requesting that the County fund up to \$1.5 million to assist in the funding for the extended ingress and egress, but that this was a discretionary item for the BOCC to determine. Commissioner Ramsay-Vickrey added that she had asked that question of staff and was told that that financial provision is not under the Planning Commission's purview. Commissioner Miller's concern is the quid pro quos of relaxing impact fees and at the same time, the BOCC contemplating a \$1.5 million road. Mr. Smith explained that the applicant is putting forth significant funds for an ingress and egress point to assure there are no decreases in level of service for traffic in an attempt to be good neighbor, and had requested County assistance with funding to offset this significant expenditure. Commissioner Miller asked Mr. Wolfe if the Commission would be voting for this applicant to eliminate impact fees. Mr. Smith interjected that this was actually in the Code for affordable housing projects. Ms. Santamaria responded, indicating that per Chapter 139, impact fees are waived for all affordable projects. Commissioner Miller then asked if the deal on the first 50 years then did not have to be made. Ms. Santamaria indicated that was offered in the

revised Development Agreement. Commissioner Miller wanted it clarified that this was not based on the impact fee waiver. Mr. Smith interjected that there are also building permit fees. Ms. Santamaria added that there is an existing adoptive process where applicants can request the County Commission to waive building permit fees for affordable housing and the BOCC has always approved those. Commissioner Miller thought this was the 50-year deal where there would be fewer moderate units based on that. Ms. Santamaria responded that that was how it was written.

Mr. Smith continued explaining the proposed ingress and egress and the applicant's ultimate goal. Staff's preliminary review is that it meets all levels of service. The applicant will continue to clean up any remaining small items that need to be done and requests the Commission recommend approval to the BOCC of the Development Agreement with conditions that the remaining items are resolved prior to the BOCC meeting.

Chair Wiatt asked about the increased affordable restriction and the commitment to not exceed 25 percent of the median monthly household income for the very low and the 60 percent of median monthly income for low, and wanted to know whether the median and moderate were not being looked at for those increased reductions. Mr. Smith confirmed that to be correct, that the median and moderate are at the rates listed on the chart. Chair Wiatt asked if that meant that 136 of the 208 affordable housing units would be at either the median or moderate maximums on the paper. Mr. Smith said it would be 114. Chair Wiatt noted that well over 50 percent would be at the full rates; a one-bedroom at \$1840 a month for median and \$2208 for moderate; and for a two-bedroom, that number is \$2284. Chair Wiatt reiterated that he wants everyone to recognize that over 50 percent of these affordable housing ROGOs will be at rents with those numbers. Commissioner Miller asked if that mix was subject to change and not written in stone for the first 50 years. Ms. Santamaria responded that the rates change every year when HUD provides a new median income. Mr. Smith added that if the applicant went below that, this project would not proceed. Commissioner Miller commented that more than a million dollars a month wouldn't be made on the income and that he did not believe this much moderate affordable was needed. Mr. Smith explained that there are construction costs and once you have bank financing for a \$40 million loan, the bank requires a debt service ratio requiring an income above that debt service ratio, which is typically between 1.2 and 1.4 of what the debt is. So for a debt with a \$300,000 a month payment, at least 360,000 to 400,000 just to ensure there is no violation of the terms. Commissioner Miller thought the math was incorrect. Mr. Smith stated 2000 times 200 is 400,000. Commissioner Miller stated he would hate to be a millionaire and have to worry about all of this.

Mr. Smith then went over various income rates in the County for teachers, nurses and law enforcement, etc., and that they are looking for median and moderate units of sufficient size where they do not feel they are in substandard housing and he strongly disagrees that the median and moderate categories will not be in demand. Every level is needed and there is just as much of a need for median and moderate. Commissioner Miller insisted that with 50 percent moderate this is not based so much on demand as it is for making money. Mr. Smith stated that the applicant absolutely needs to make sure that the project can be financed. The applicant is not the government and yet is providing affordable housing.

Commissioner Johnston commented that a number of these projects have been sent down in flames by picking apart the percentage that is very low and low income. This project provides 45 percent of these units as very low and low, and now the percentage of median and moderate units is being scrutinized. Commissioner Johnston believes this is a very good project and perhaps reasons are being found to take these affordable housing projects down. Commissioner Wiatt agreed, explaining that his intention is to make sure everyone understands the big picture. As long as the community recognizes that a two-bedroom moderate rental is close to \$2500 a month, then everyone can make an informed decision. Commissioner Ramsay-Vickrey added that she agrees with Commissioner Johnston, that 45 percent low and very low balanced to 55 percent moderate and median is reasonable. She also likes it these prices are fixed as there is price gouging going on in the Lower Keys presently and that what people are getting for inadequate housing right now would make you cry.

Chair Wiatt asked if there were further questions of the applicant. There were none. Chair Wiatt then opened public comment and Mr. Wolfe swore in everyone intending to speak.

Sheriff Rick Ramsay stated this is a very important and long-overdue project Countywide. The number one concern for the Keys is affordable workforce housing. The Sheriff's Office is one of the largest employers. After Hurricane Irma, he has lost 10 percent of his workforce. This project will not stop the bleeding today, but we have to start some day. Employers throughout the Keys have the same problem of getting and keeping staff. He has 25 to 27 positions open at the jail and has had to shut down the Marathon jail, moving staff from there to Key West, to support the main jail facility. When staff leaves, he hears the same story, people love the Sheriff's Office and the Keys but they can't afford to live here. Price gouging is occurring. One of his sergeant's was paying \$2500 in rent before the hurricane and it's now been raised to \$3700. All throughout the Lower Keys businesses are looking for employees, everyone has the same problem. We have to be part of the solution. There are issues to be worked out. The applicants have made efforts to resolve traffic concerns. The housing need is so overwhelming. Fault can be found forever, but lack of action is the bigger problem. This looks like a beautiful complex. The County has low income salaries starting at 51,000. Deputies start at 46,000 so anyone starting with the Sheriff's Office is low income. We have to have someplace for these people to live and housing is needed at every level. He believes this project is critical for all local businesses.

Mr. Mike Bellows, a resident and homeowner on Riveria Drive on Big Coppitt, voiced concern about the substantial last-minute changes to the Development Agreement. The proposal is totally different than what was outlined for today's agenda. This Commission should not vote on a proposal that was not advertised on the agenda. There may be others who would have shown up today if given a chance to review and consider the new Development Agreement. This County operates under a democratic system. Major events that impact peoples' lives are presented with due process and everyone has a right to be heard. Mr. Bellows referenced a drawing comparing the parcel of land proposed for development with the existing adjacent neighborhood. The development proposed is for 208 units on 15 acres, whereas the adjacent neighborhood totals approximately 72 residents. The proposed development is almost three times the density of the adjacent neighborhood. There are many more people who will be impacted by this Development Agreement that did not have a chance to appear today. If this

development does go forward, he would ask that a more than adequate buffer be required between existing homes and the proposed development. According to the current site plan, the developer's main road is up against his house which will no doubt result in noisy traffic coming in and out of the site at all hours of the night. The existing neighborhood is a quiet street. Parking and waste collection areas are against the back yards of the houses on Riveria Drive which will bring noisy garbage collection to the back yard in addition to their pickup in the front.

Mr. Robert Lockwood, Monroe County Public Defender, shared an email exchange he had with a potential employee who could not accept a position due to the cost of housing. Though he had been fortunate to find everyone in his office a place to live after the hurricane, he is also getting calls about the increasing rental rates. When he's hiring people his first concern is whether the potential employee can afford to live here. He has lost 120 years of legal experience to retirement last July. He is in favor of any workforce housing. His last hire was a Navy spouse where the Navy provides housing. He is going to Tallahassee to ask the State, for the first time, for extra funding so he can play his employees more.

Mr. David Clay of the Lower Keys Medical Center explained that his situation is similar. He lost five percent of his workforce due to the hurricane and still has over 20 individuals looking for housing. He has highly-technical positions that he can't fill in the Lower Keys due to the lack of housing affordability. This project would be a small piece of the total solution needed. Any support the community can get regarding affordable housing would be appreciated and helpful in the medical community.

Mr. Bob Perryam, former Sheriff of Monroe County, indicated he was speaking on behalf of himself and former Sheriffs DeFoor and Roth, who along with current Sheriff Ramsay represents over 30 years of Sheriffs in Monroe County and over 100 years of service. Affordable housing has been a major issue for the Sheriff's Office when it comes to recruitment and retention as previously spoken of by Sheriff Ramsay. This year the Sheriff's Office will reach between a 15 to 17 percent turnover largely due to the affordable housing issue. The same is happening for the Key West Police Department, the school system and the hospital. This is not just a government issue, but also a hospitality industry and small business issue. All employees want to fulfill the basic needs for their families of food, clothing and a safe and secure place to live. All of these people make up this community and provide the services to all. Affordable housing has been talked about for many years but since Hurricane Irma, it is a critical emergency that must be dealt with now. Approving this project now will start us in the right direction, along with providing local jobs which are needed since the storm. There is only so much land in the Florida Keys and no better way to use this land than affordable using. Mr. Perryam believes this project will have a positive effect on the quality of life for many people in the Keys. Additionally, this project is being developed by a long-time local family that has a vested interest in the success of this community.

Commissioner Miller asked staff if there was any guarantee that people who did not live and work here would not be able to occupy these units. Ms. Santamaria responded that the requirements are income based and it's not required that occupants be a current resident of Monroe County.

Mr. Trace Vey (phonetic) is a medi-vac pilot for NAS Key West, recently moved to the Keys in July and purchased a home in Rockland. He is proof that it is possible to buy a home in the Keys while being employed by a government agency. He sympathizes with the Sheriff and Public Defender and would like to see them be able to choose their housing and buy something suitable. He supports this project but believes there is some confusion as to the traffic flow because of the last-minute changes. The intersection of Calle Uno and U.S. 1 is not that bad now, but adding all of these units would potentially back everyone up. Coming into Calle Dos is sometimes tough because there are drivers coming from the 55 mile zone funneling down to one lane. He would like to see the access road go through the Toppino property and get direct access to U.S. 1, but hopes the project goes through.

Ms. Deb Curlee, Vice President of Last Stand, spoke on behalf of Last Stand. Last Stand understands and supports the post-Irma need for affordable housing, but does not believe any project should be at the expense and safety of residents and visitors. The unaddressed traffic issues generated by this large project have been subject for rejection by the County staff since the beginning of the project's proposal. Now, a last-minute, unstudied proposed solution to traffic issues that should have been addressed as the project proceeded has come before the Commission without any public input for a County-financed road through wetlands. In the backup documentation, it clearly says that Monroe County agreed to a \$1.5 million contribution. The traffic issues need to be addressed and solidly accepted before this goes forward. Procedurally, this should be reviewed with enough time to give it the full attention it deserves. Last Stand would request this item be continued until proper traffic studies and public input can be achieved.

Mr. Eduardo Herrera, a 34-year resident of Calle Uno, agrees there is a great need in the community for affordable housing, but that it is important the Commission take specific note of the traffic. This project comprises 480 parking spaces. The traffic study estimates more than 1000 daily trips in and out of that neighborhood with a single lane of road both entering onto and exiting from. At a community meeting it was suggested the developer at least take a look at developing a road through their own land. The attorney at that meeting had indicated it was cost prohibitive which he found comical for a developer whose primary business is roadway development to say. He would ask the Commission to stay this item and take an in-depth look at the traffic study. Calle Uno and Calle Dos is already classified as Class C, and approaching Class D at certain times of the day.. Adding more than 1000 daily trips, which he believes is an underestimate, will create a major impact not only for the existing residents but those traveling inbound and outbound in the morning and afternoon.

Mr. Louis Latorre of Big Pine Key believes this project is needed and he is not against it, but he is concerned with the traffic. The entrance to the project needs to be on Rockland. There are 1400 homes in the Big Coppitt district and 94 vacant lots which are buildable. There are also 2400 registered voters in that district. He is pleased to see that this traffic won't come through the Big Coppitt area as it is already congested.

Ms. Karen Thurman, a Marathon resident and manager of the Faro Blanco Yacht Club and Resort and the Hyatt Place, stated that pre-Irma it took her a good three to four months to find housing here. Had she not been a 25-plus resident of the Keys who knew people, she might still

not have found housing. She has employee housing for her employees and has a waiting list over double the units available. Currently there are over a hundred locals being housed with FEMA benefits which end on January 6 and she does not know where they will go. An opportunity like this cannot be passed up to be able to accommodate that many people in that area. It is one area for good public transportation and school buses to pick up and one area for garbage pickup. There is a crisis now which only got worse after Irma. Traffic concerns and other things can still be addressed in later meetings, but we can't afford to lose this.

Mr. Steve Johns, general manager of Holiday Inn Express and Suites in Marathon, reiterated what the prior speaker had stated, adding that he had 20 FEMA units in his hotel, 10 of which are housing for employees, including himself. A lot of them are scared, not knowing what they will do after January. He had four resignations yesterday because they can't afford to live here anymore or they have lost their trailers and can't put them back on the same property. The concern for housing is great and we all need it. There is no employee pool here and employees come from either Key West or Homestead and Florida City. When the closed hotels do open up, they will lose those employees as no one will want to ride 2.5 hours each way to work. Most of the hotel employees are in the very low or low income category.

Mr. Joe Walsh, who is on the board of directors of the Key West Chamber of Commerce, spoke on behalf of the Chamber. Additional quality workforce housing is of critical concern in the Florida Keys. This development providing 208 units of affordable housing addresses some of this need. The Chamber respectfully requests the Commission approve this proposal. Mr. Walsh, speaking on his own behalf, stated he works every day at the corner of Calle Uno and Calle Dos. His companies employ approximately 300 people in Key West and the Lower Keys. This particular project offers housing at a wide range of rates and was able to do this because of tax credit funding. It is impossible for a developer to build units at these rates without tax credit funding. This is an opportunity to address the affordable housing concerns. Almost everyone has employees that would qualify at some level for this housing. This is also an attractive waterfront project with water views that will be deed restricted as affordable. Mr. Walsh encouraged the Commission to pass this project along and let the developer continue to sort out the remaining issues. A number of the developers live in the same neighborhood and have made their livelihood here for generations. They will build a project that will be something that the Lower Keys can be proud of.

Mr. Keith Douglas, Chairman of the Village of Islamorada's Achievable Housing Citizens' Advisory Committee, stated that finding solutions to affordable housing is of high priority and he wishes Islamorada could find the land to do what is being done here today. The housing crisis must be addressed and affects everyone's quality of life. The area is losing entry-level professionals and can't attract anyone to replace them. Creative solutions must be found and we can't be deterred by the NIMBYs. Ways around traffic issues must be found. This is a wonderful partnership with the Toppino family who has been a part of this community for generations. Though he appreciates that the Commission and County staff are wrestling with some tough stuff, he encourages them to continue to do so.

Mr. Jim Wilson, also on the board for the Chamber of Commerce, stated that over the past almost 30 years he has appraised a lot of properties and a lot of affordable housing projects. The

numbers don't work unless the land is free or there is some sort of tax subsidy. The fact that the Toppinos are doing 45 percent lower-end housing is remarkable. He and his wife were one of the first buyers at Flagler Court in Key West, the first affordable housing project in Key West. Everyone around there complained about the same issues as are being heard with this project. Unfortunately, the Flagler Court project only had a 15-year restriction. A lot of those people who came in the early nineties still live there or have moved up to the next house in the Keys. These are managers of Home Depot or in City government. This problem can't be kicked any longer. It is such a crisis now there is political cover. There's a lot of smart people in this room that can resolve the traffic issues and he can't imagine killing this many units for that one roadblock. New people are needed and they aren't coming. Local businesses can't compete because they can't get workers. Instead we're getting people from out of town who don't shop and live locally, contractors being an example. Mr. Wilson asked the Commission to not lose sight of the big picture. We need affordable housing and everyone knows it. Let's just get it done.

County Commissioner George Neugent stated this was his first time in 20 years that he has come before the Planning Commission. He recognized the important role of the Planning Commission and thanked them for doing a lot of the Commission's heavy lifting. Commissioner Neugent stated that he was not asking this Commission to do anything other than send this project forward to the County Commission to deal with some of these issues. There are tough decisions to be made at the County Commission level and money is one of them, but they must figure out a way to make this work. The intersection improvements can also be made to work for the residents. There was an affordable housing problem prior to Irma, and now the problem is critical and must be dealt with. The Keys economy cannot recover without a workforce and he predicts between 10 to 15 percent of that workforce will be lost due to this storm. Over \$900,000 has been spent already through a non-profit organization he is involved with in an effort to retain people in the Keys. Additional trailers are being sought because FEMA has lived up to its reputation of not being able to accomplish a whole lot. Temporary but somewhat long-term housing must be found for people to rebuild their houses. Commissioner Neugent asked the Planning Commission not to delay on moving this project forward. The sooner it comes before the County Commission, the sooner they can begin discussing solutions for the remaining issues.

Mr. Bill Hunter of Sugarloaf stated that everything he had planned on saying he threw out the window. The need for this project has been here for a long time and the storm has made it worse. Something needs to be done. This is a project that fills the need stated by the Affordable Housing Committee in that it is close to the employment, which is extremely important. This is the kind of affordable housing desired. He differs slightly with Mayor Cates as there is a difference between the inconvenience of traffic and the safety of traffic. It is important this gets done right from a traffic perspective. This many people can't be put in a place that didn't have them before without dealing with traffic, but he is asking that these issues be worked out as it is important to the neighbors, those who will actually live there and the residents going by the project every day. Mr. Hunter believes this is a good project that should be approved.

Chair Wiatt asked if there was further public comment. There was none. Public comment was closed. Chair Wiatt asked for input from the Commission.

Commissioner Miller stated that most people like fish but because he wants to cook his differently than others want it cooked doesn't mean that he doesn't like fish. Paying attention to details is part of the Commission's job. Making sure a public project like this is done right is the least he can do.

Commissioner Johnston added that she understands Commissioner Miller's concerns as there was a great amount of information that came in late. But as with any project, it is dynamic. You get public input and it can change based on public input. Modifications are made based on easements and negotiations. Commissioner Miller responded that he does not believe projects should be dynamic, that people should know what they're getting. Commissioner Johnston agreed but noted the Planning Commission is not the last vote. Staff should be relied upon. Mr. Kevin Bond stated the new traffic patterns look favorable. She believes these concerns will be evaluated to the fullest extent before passing the project on to the BOCC. Staff will take the time that the Commission has not had to look into the details with traffic specialists. Sheriff Ramsay weighed in who is probably the ultimate definitive person on traffic being on U.S. 1 every day. Commissioner Johnston also noted that there are some things that should be made conditional to pass along to the BOCC, but believes it's time to send this on to them to do the remaining research needed to make the public comfortable. The public will have another opportunity for input at the County Commission level. This project is not new and information has been in the paper and on the radio weekly. Changes can be made based on public comment and new information. From the Planning Commission's perspective, this project is below the maximum density levels, is above the parking required and the affordable housing mix is one of the best seen. This is being developed by a multi-generational family in the Florida Keys that employs local people who understand the need. Common sense dictates there will be changes in traffic, as there is when a single-family home goes up and we have to roll with the changes. We can make this as safe as possible and make sure the public is not being put at any disadvantage, but this project needs to be moved forward to create some adequate workforce housing.

Commissioner Ramsay-Vickrey stated that given the comments, she was making a motion to approve the revised development agreement without the provision for the County commitment of \$1.5 million towards the road construction cost and the U.S. 1 easement. If the BOCC wants to take up that issue, they are the proper body to do that. Additionally, a condition providing staff's full review and recommendation of the new traffic report before it proceeds to the BOCC. Commissioner Johnston seconded the motion.

Chair Wiatt wanted to explain some of his earlier questions prior to the item going to vote. This is a great opportunity for this Commission to address the public as there are so many power brokers present. One of the things that didn't come up is the idea that there are a finite number of ROGOs available and when those are done, they are done. Every time an affordable housing project comes before them, he starts crunching numbers to see how many of these very value affordable housing ROGOs are going to go to very low and low income. After sitting on the Affordable Housing Committee, he knows there is a need for all levels, but there is a really big need for the very low and low. He tries to get that number to above 50 percent and this project is 45. However, this developer went above and beyond on the very low and low and are actually going to provide housing at rental rates below what the maximum allowable is for very low and low and that will allow him to vote for this project. Chair Wiatt added that these projects are not

no-brainers. The consequence of letting all projects go through without being dissected to ensure they are getting the biggest bang for the buck results in a lot of moderate and median housing eating up the few available affordable housing ROGOs which he believes would be a disservice to the County. Chair Wiatt believes it is very important to push to get these projects through, but in a way that supports the very low and low income numbers.

Motion: Commissioner Ramsay-Vickrey made a motion to approve with the provision that staff fully review the new traffic report and without the commitment of the \$1.5 million for the road improvements. Commissioner Johnston seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Commissioner Ramsay-Vickrey, Yes; Commissioner Johnston, Yes; Commissioner Miller, Yes; Chair Wiatt, Yes.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Chair Wiatt stated that the 2018 schedule needed to be discussed. As a result of Chair Wiatt's upcoming knee surgery, the date of February 26 was discussed as an option for that month's Planning Commission Meeting. Ms. Santamaria indicated that she would look into room availability for that date.

ADJOURNMENT

The Monroe County Planning Commission meeting was adjourned at 12:30 p.m.