

HPC

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission MINUTES

Monday October 1, 2018

Tavernier Fire House, 151 Marine Ave., Tavernier



2:00 PM Regular Meeting:

Call to Order.

Roll Call.

Present and answering to roll call were Chair-Commissioner Alice Allen, Commissioner Donna Bosold, Commissioner Kate DeLoach, and Commissioner Anne-Marie Victor-Howe. Absent was Commissioner Bert Bender.

Staff present: Barbara Bauman, Senior Planner
Devin Tolpin, Senior Planner
Steve Williams, Assistant County Attorney
Diane Silvia, Preservationist

Adoption of the Minutes from the August 6, 2018 meeting.

Donna Bosold motioned to approve the minutes from the August 6, 2018 meeting. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion carried unanimously.

Changes to the Agenda.

Chair Commissioner Alice Allen asked if the representatives for the Angler's Club would mind allowing agenda items 2-5 to be heard first as their projects are less complex and would take little time. Jim Lupino, attorney for the Anglers Club agreed to extend that courtesy.

Applications for Special Certificate of Appropriateness

1. Angler's Club Members Association, Inc. (File No. 2018-138) is proposing clubhouse improvements at 50 Clubhouse Road, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 000800200-000300 and legally described as (continued from the August 6th, 2018 meeting):

The Club Facilities Unit, ANGLERS CLUB, a condominium, according to the Declaration of Condominium thereof, recorded in Official Records Book 1028, Page 2375 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, and any amendments thereto.

Applicant presentation of additional material

James Lupino, Attorney for the Anglers Club said he provided additional Monroe County documents for the Commission which he sees they received. Jon Olson, Architect and Brian Idle,

President of Peacock & Lewis Architects and Planners, LLC. and Christopher Everhart, Executive Director of Anglers Club, are also there to represent the project.

Alice Allen said we cannot review this material when we receive it at the meeting.

Mr. Lupino said just so you understand, this is additional information that was requested. It was overnighted to Ms. Silvia last Tuesday.

Diane Silvia said she received it on Thursday.

Mr. Lupino said this is just the collection of legal documents I will review in closing. He explained they want to protect the historic nature of the building. The interior and the furniture are staying the way they are. Hurricane Andrew destroyed the exterior. This is a private clubhouse that must stay financially viable in a more competitive club market. It will be privately financed. The bathrooms must be made in compliance with ADA requirements. Christopher Everhart's office is leaking and has mold. It is the interior of the building that is significant. A vote to approve this project will be to preserve it. The Club's significant features are inside. These will be preserved and protected. It was designated as a historical and cultural landmark in 1993. Holly Larson's letter indicated the historic designation was for the interior. He reviewed the previous approvals and said the proposed work will strengthen the building.

Brian Idle, President of Peacock & Lewis Architects and Planners, LLC explained they work with hospitality projects world-wide and always recommend they build on their strengths. The club world is a competitive market. They have made some changes to the plans based on comments from the last meeting. They have had meetings with the membership to get feedback. They have eliminated the bay windows from the formal dining room. The west elevation is critical as people are seeking the outdoors. They will use wood columns instead of rock on the gazebo and remove the cupola. He then went through the ten Secretary's Standards for Rehabilitation and explained how he feels the proposed project complies to all of them. They are developing an efficient contemporary use to attract younger generations and need to create a venue for casual dining. It is the lodge and lobby that are historic. After Hurricane Andrew, they could have demolished the building. Two additions, the gazebo at the rear and the office in front, have been added since the designation in 1993. The original lodge and log walls are preserved. The envelope of the building will have a wind resistance of 170 mph and the new building materials will look the same. This project will alter three facades. The living room is a museum and they plan to create a larger library.

Mr. Lupino referred to the bound copies of Monroe County legal documents he compiled dealing with this property since 1986 and reviewed them with the Commissioners. Included were the approvals for future development by the Planning Commission. This work will preserve and protect the clubhouse for the future.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Board discussion

Anne-Marie Victor-Howe said she visited the property and feels the historic part is inside and has been preserved. It is a beautiful piece of art. They are asking to add on to what has already been added to.

Mr. Idle said they are hoping to make these additions in a more sensitive manner, like using re-claimed wood to keep the historic look.

Donna Bosold said she was contacted by James Lupino and visited the Club. She feels Holly Larson's letter does emphasize the interior. She is pleased to see the bay windows have been removed from the dining room and appreciates the columns being changed to wood.

Kate Deloach said she also spoke with Mr. Lupino and visited the site. She agreed that the interior is what is historically significant.

Alice Allen disclosed she spoke with Mr. Lupino and that he was a piano student of hers as a child. She did not visit the site. Typically, we deal with the windshield view of buildings and do not review interiors. The interior has been beautifully preserved. The structure will be further strengthened which will help protect it.

Motion

Anne-Marie Victor-Howe motioned to approve the project as the exterior portions to be impacted have already been so altered they are not considered to be historic. Donna Bosold seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion passed unanimously.

2. LBK16 Residence Trust (File No. 2018-161) is proposing to remove an existing dock, riprap, and boat ramp and construct a 4 foot wide by 215 feet long access walkway leading to a 8 foot wide by 20 foot long terminal platform to house a 20,000 lb. capacity cradle boat lift and a 10,000 lb. capacity elevator boat lift and install two mooring piles at 216 Tarpon Street, within the Tavernier Historic District, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00506130-000100 and legally described as:

Lot 24 and the South One Half of Lot 25, of Singleton's Addition to Tavernier Cove, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 1 at Page 135 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida. Any and all of that certain strip lying below high tide mark and designate "Private Promenade", between Lots twenty-three (23) and twenty-four (24) of Singleton's Addition to Tavernier Cove and the Atlantic Ocean; together with any and all reversions and riparian rights thereunto appertaining, or any wise belonging. That certain strip of land lying between the high water mark and Lot 24, Singleton's Addition to Tavernier Cove, according to the plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 1, at Page 135 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, and designated "Private Promenade" on said plat. All the right, title, interest, claim and demand in and to the following described lot, piece or parcel of land, situate, lying and being the County of Monroe, State of Florida, to-wit; any and all of that certain strip in front of Lot 24, lying below high tide mark and designated "Private Promenade" of Singleton's

Addition to Tavernier Cove and the Atlantic Ocean. Together with any and all reversions and riparian rights thereunto appertaining or in any wise belonging.

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable Secretary of the Interiors Standards for Rehabilitation and Tavernier Historic District Guidelines.

Applicant presentation

James Spencer, Trustee of LBK16 Residence Trust was present and had nothing further to add.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Board discussion

Alice Allen noted that the project area sustained severe damage with Irma. There was no other board discussion.

Motion

Donna Bosold motioned to approve the project as planned. Kate Deloach seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion passed unanimously.

Legal Description For Pigeon Key: Agenda Items 3 and 4

The subject property is physically located at 44800 Overseas Highway and is legally described as: All of the lands heretofore deeded to the Overseas Road and Toll Bridge District from the Florida East Coast Railway Company by deed dated November 9, 1936, and recorded in Deed Record G-6, Pages 46 to 55, both inclusive, Monroe County, Florida, Public Records excepting therefrom all lands which have been deeded by said Overseas Road and Toll Bridge District and which deeds are of record as of the date of this conveyance to Monroe County, Florida, and also excepting the strip of land One Hundred feet (100') wide being Fifty feet (50') in width on each side of the center line of the right-of-way of the former Florida East Coast Railway, as same was constructed and operated between the center line dividing Sections Twenty-one (21) and Twenty (20) in Township 64, South of Range 36 East, to the Section Line between Sections Twenty-five (25) and Twenty-six (26) in Township 66, South of Range 29 East, including all trestles, structures, bridges and riparian rights, all in Monroe County, Florida, being part of the lands deeded to the Overseas Road and Toll-Bridge District by deed dated November 9, 1936, and recorded in Deed Record G-6, pages 46 to 55, both inclusive, Monroe County, Florida, Public Records,

or AKA:

All of Pigeon Key, an island approximately 5.31 acres located at Mile Marker 45, along the Old Seven Mile Bridge, Lot 1, Section 13, Township 66 South, Range 31 East, Tallahassee Meridian, and deeded to the Overseas Road and Toll Bridge District from the Florida East Coast Railway Company by Deed dated November 9, 1936, and recorded in Deed Record G-6, pages 46 to 55, and thereafter deeded to Monroe County by Warranty Deed, recorded at OR-15, pages 374 to 376, having Real Estate Number: 00106120-000000.

3. The Monroe County BOCC (File No. 2018-165) is proposing to demolish the CBS “battery shed” due to hurricane damage at Pigeon Key, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00106120-000000 and legally described above.

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable Secretary of the Interiors Standards for Rehabilitation.

Applicant presentation

Mike Puto, Vice-President of the Pigeon Key Foundation, was present to answer questions. He explained they are working with DOT and the Florida Keys Electric Coop in hopes of eventually adding electric lines to the bridge so a replacement building would not be necessary.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Board discussion

There was no board discussion.

Motion

Kate Deloach motioned to approve the project as planned. Donna Bosold seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion passed unanimously.

4. The Monroe County BOCC (File No. 2018-166) is proposing to install a solar powered battery power plant within a trailer which will eventually be housed within a rebuilt CBS replacement structure at Pigeon Key, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00106120-000000 and legally described above.

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable Secretary of the Interiors Standards for Rehabilitation.

Applicant presentation

Mike Puto, Vice-President of the Pigeon Key Foundation explained this trailer is being requested so that in case of a storm event it could be removed from the island by barge.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Board discussion

There was no board discussion.

Motion

Kate Deloach motioned to approve the project as planned. Donna Bosold seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion passed unanimously.

5. Jeffrey Hale (File No. 2018-172) is proposing to install a concrete paver driveway at 224 Tavernier Drive, within the Tavernier Historic District, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00478000-000000 and legally described as:

A portion of vacated right of way of former Washington Avenue, adjoining and northerly of Lot 1, Block 9, Largo Beach, according to the plat thereof recorded in Plat Book 1 at Page 108 of the public records of Monroe County, Florida, and being more particularly described as follows: For a Point of Beginning, begin on the southerly right of way line of said Washington Avenue at the northwesterly corner of said Lot 1; thence northwesterly along a prolongation of the boundary line common to Lots 1 and 2, Block 9 of said plat for a distance of 25 feet to the centerline of said Washington Avenue; thence northeasterly along said centerline for a distance of 5.31 feet to the southwesterly right of way line of Coconut Row according to said plat; thence southeasterly along said right of way line for a distance of 21.70 feet to a point; thence southwesterly 18.40 feet to the Point of Beginning. Containing 262 square feet more or loss.

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable Secretary of the Interiors Standards for Rehabilitation and Tavernier Historic District Guidelines.

Applicant presentation

Robin Young, agent for the owner, had nothing further to add.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Board discussion

Anne-Marie Victor-Howe said we should approve what we have before for pavers. They should be pervious.

Donna Bosold said she agreed.

Robin Young said all pavers are considered about 30% pervious. The maximum is up to 60%. The property owner is installing swales.

Motion

Donna Bosold motioned to approve the project with the condition that pervious pavers are installed. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion passed unanimously.

Other Business:

There was no other business.

Adjournment.

Donna Bosold motioned to adjourn. Kate Deloach seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion passed unanimously.