

HPC

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday July 9, 2018

Tavernier Fire House, 151 Marine Ave., Tavernier



2:00 PM Regular Meeting:

Call to Order.

Roll Call.

Present and answering to roll call were Chair-Commissioner Alice Allen, Commissioner Donna Bosold, Commissioner Kate DeLoach, and Commissioner Anne-Marie Victor-Howe.

Absent was Commissioner Bert Bender.

Staff present: Barbara Bauman, Principal Planner
Peter Morris, Assistant County Attorney
Diane Silvia, Preservationist

Adoption of the Minutes from the May 7, 2018 meeting.

Kate DeLoach motioned to approve the minutes from the May 7, 2018 meeting. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion carried unanimously.

Changes to the Agenda.

There were no changes to the agenda.

Applications for Special Certificate of Appropriateness

1. Harold McMahan (File 2018-093) is proposing to remove and replace existing swimming pool, deck, and security fencing and add stairs, an elevated deck and roof structure over a portion of the deck at 197 Lowe Street within the Tavernier Historic District, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00566370-000000 and legally described as:

All of Block 5, less the West 71 feet of AMENDED PLAT OF TAVERNIER BEACH, a subdivision in Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 1, Page 201, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida.

AND

A parcel of filled sovereignty land in Tavernier Harbor abutting Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, said parcel being more particularly described as follows:

Commence at the Northwest corner of Block 5, Amended plat of Tavernier Beach as recorded in

Plat Book 1, Page 201 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida; thence Easterly 312 feet along the North line of said Block 5 to its intersection with the Mean High Water Line as shown on said Amended Plat and the Point of Beginning; thence continue Easterly 10 feet along said North line of Block 5 extended; then South 6 degrees 15 minutes last 44.49 feet; thence South 23 degrees 12 minutes East 30.46 feet; thence South 85 degrees 52 minutes 45 seconds East 69.60 feet; to an Easterly extension of a line 23 feet North of and parallel to the South line of said Block 5; thence Westerly 96 feet along said Easterly extension to the Mean High Water Line as shown on Amended Plat of Tavernier Beach; thence Northerly 75 feet to the Point of Beginning.

AND

A parcel of submerged land in the Straits of Florida in Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, more particularly described as follows:

Beginning at an iron bolt on the shore of the Atlantic Ocean at the mean high tide line and on the dividing line between Block 5 and Lowe Street, all as shown on the Amended Plat of Tavernier Beach, according to Plat Book 1, Page 201, Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, and run South 84 degrees 43 minutes East on the Easterly prolongation of said dividing line a distance of 200 feet; thence North 5 degrees 17 minutes East, a distance of 23 feet; thence North 84 degrees 43 minutes West, a distance of 200 feet; thence North 84 degrees 43 minutes West, a distance of 200 feet to the said mean high tide line; then South along said mean high tide line a distance of 23 feet to the Point of Beginning.

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Applicant presentation

Charles Schafstall represented the project.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Board discussion

Donna Bosold asked about the elevated pool.

Mr. Schafstall said he has reviewed this project with Jennifer Ballard, a county Floodplain Manager and it is necessary to get the pool above flood. He noted the existing pool is also elevated.

Anne-Marie Victor-Howe asked what this meant.

Ms. Bosold said it because the pool is in a high velocity flood zone.

Motion

Donna Bosold motioned to approve the project as planned. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion carried unanimously.

2. Raul and Maria Santamarina (File No. 2018-094) are proposing to install an elevator and remove and replace the stairway and rear deck with concrete at 231 Tavernier Drive within the Tavernier Historic District, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00477830-000000 and legally described as:

A parcel of submerged land in the Straits of Florida, in Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East, Key Largo and fronting LOTS 2, 3 and 4, BLOCK 8 of LARGO BEACH, as per plat recorded in Plat Book 1 at Page 108, Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, more particularly described as follows:

From the Northeast corner of LOT 2 in said BLOCK 8, run Southerly along the East side of said LOT 2, a distance of 150 feet to the Southeast corner of LOT 2 at the mean high tide line and the point of beginning of the parcel hereinafter described: thence continue Southerly on last described course, a distance of 200 feet thence Westerly at right angles to last described course, a distance of 150 feet; thence Northerly along the Southerly prolongation of the West side of LOT 4 in said BLOCK 8, a distance of 200 feet to the Southwest corner of said LOT 4; thence Easterly along the Southerly sides of LOTS 4, 3 and 2 of said BLOCK 8 and along the mean high tide line, a distance of 150 feet to the point of beginning, containing 0.69 acres, more or less.

Less and excepting the following legally described parcel of submerged land:

That certain parcel of submerged land in the Straits of Florida, in Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East, Key Largo, and fronting Lots 2 and 3, Block 8, LARGO BEACH, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 1, at Page 108, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, more particularly described as follows:

From the Northeast corner of Lot 2 in said Block 8 run Southerly along the East side of said Lot 2, a distance of 150 feet to the Southeast corner of Lot 2 at the mean high tide line and the point of beginning of the parcel hereinafter described; thence continue Southerly on last described course, a distance of 200 feet thence Westerly at right angles to the last described course, a distance of 100 feet; thence Northerly along the Southerly prolongation of the West side of Lot 3 in said Block 8, a distance of 200 feet to the Southwest corner of said Lot 3; thence Easterly along the Southerly sides of Lots 3 and 2, Block 8 and along the mean high tide line, a distance of 100 feet to the point of beginning.

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Applicant presentation

Thomas Skidmore, agent for the owners, represented the project. He explained the wood decking was damaged in Irma and will be replaced with concrete all in the same footprint.

Public testimony

Jimmy Anderson, 181 Coconut Row, explained he has known Raul and Maria Santamarina for six years. They both require this elevator for medical reasons. He has spoken with the adjacent neighbors and there are no objections.

Staff response

There was no staff response.

Applicant response

There was no applicant response.

Board discussion

The Commissioners had no questions about the proposed project.

Motion

Kate Deloach motioned to approve the project as planned. Donna Bosold seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion carried unanimously.

3. Jocelyn Tiedeman (File No. 2018-114) is proposing to construct a new single-family residence with a gravel driveway at 144 Sunrise Drive within the Tavernier Historic District, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00-00506320-000000 and legally described as:

Lot 39, TAVERNIER COVE, according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 1, Page 103 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida.

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Applicant presentation

Jocelyn Tiedeman handed out packets with revised drawings to the Commissioners. She said there have been minor revisions. She is enclosing the rear porch and carrying the rear porch roofline all the way across, so there is room for a dining room.

Peter Morris said the public may look at the new drawings.

John Howe asked if the square footage was increasing.

Ms. Tiedeman said it is increasing by 70 square feet. Overall it will be 1,550 square feet.

Anne-Marie Victor-Howe said this is a lot of changes. This has happened before, and we reject the application for something like this.

Ms. Tiedeman said I thought you were mostly concerned with the appearance of the front of the building.

Alice Allen said the drawings we received in the packet were very faint. Did you submit full size drawings?

Ms. Tiedeman said she submitted five full size sets.

Barbara Bauman said yes she did.

Diane Silvia said she received 8 ½" X 11" copies and had them blown up to 11" X17".

Ms. Allen said we need to be able to read the copy.

Ms. Bosold said if you look at the left elevation the fenestration is changed, and you added stairs at the front and rear.

Ms. Tiedeman said if these changes are a problem she will just go with the original submittal.

Ms. Bosold said we want to work with our applicants as much as possible. This is new construction in a sensitive area. We look at vacant lots from scratch.

Ms. Allen said it is a matter of giving us time to review this.

Peter Morris said you can continue this if you want more time to review this new information.

Ms. Tiedeman said here architect was uncooperative, so she whited out areas on the plans and drew in the changes herself.

Ms. Tiedeman explained the proposed house is in the center of the lot, so they can retain the perimeter of trees. The lot is only 50' wide so that is why they designed a two-story structure.

Anne-Marie Victor-Howe said there is a driveway.

Ms. Allen asked if she could do a one-story structure.

Ms. Tiedeman said if she did only a few trees would be left. The yellow one across the street is two-story.

Public testimony

John Howe, a neighbor at 149 Sunrise Drive, said a two story is too big. The fact that it is too story and the height violates the guidelines. He presented a petition signed by 12 people that

oppose the project. He read from pages 5, 20, and 30 of the guidelines in support of the opposition. He likes the small-scale nature of the neighborhood. From an economic standpoint, it might threaten their property values and effect tourism as many visitors come by to view the neighborhood. I would encourage you to encourage the applicant to come back with a design of appropriate scale.

Sue Hein said 148 Sunrise Drive is a single-story structure on stilts.

Lisa Braman, a neighbor at 160 Sunrise Drive said that corner is very important. This house would be like a billboard. Small houses and the foliage are what make the neighborhood. This design does not say historic Tavernier.

Ron Gallo, resident at 137 Sunrise Drive, asked what is the law. Is there anyone from the county that can tell me if this is one-story or two story.

Barbara Bauman said if there are two floors it is a two-story.

Mr. Gallo said even it is on stilts.

Ms. Bauman said she is from the Monroe County Planning Department. We look at the overall height.

Mr. Gallo said he does not understand. Stilt houses are not attractive. Does the county require stilts? Which department makes the final decision on what is allowed? Who has the most power?

Staff response

Peter Morris explained each of the different entities has their set of responsibilities. Building oversees construction, Planning oversees zoning, and the HPC design review.

Mr. Gallo said then this board has the power to deny this.

Applicant response

Ms. Tiedeman said the HPC must approve the project before it can be submitted to the Building Department. The house is not 35' high like it states in the petition. It is only one foot above flood with 8' tie beams for a total height of 26 feet high. The house will not look like a billboard, it is set back 25' feet. Steve Lomar who sold her the lot said he always envisioned a two-story there.

Anne-Marie Victor-Howe said he told me you wanted to build a conch house.

If they build a one-story structure most of the vegetation will have to be removed. She does not want to scarify the lot any more than necessary. She does not want to wait another 30 days if a two-story design will just be shot down. There are multi-story buildings along the waterfront.

Board discussion

Alice Allen said that is a different setting.

Mr. Howe said why doesn't she scale down the size of the structure. She wants three bedrooms and two bathrooms. This is not a given. He understands she is interested in making money in real estate.

Donna Bosold recommended doing a survey of the neighboring structures to determine their heights. Is this a primary residence?

Ms. Tiedeman said no. She does not want to wait another 30 days.

Mr. Morris asked for the record do you want the board to review the original plan now or would you consider waiting 30 days to have this revision reviewed.

Ms. Tiedeman would like the original submission approved today and then come back in 30 days with the revision if that is possible.

Ms. Allen said it does not work that way.

Ms. Tiedeman said then I would rather go with the original submission and if it is denied start from scratch. I think it will be ten times worse next month.

Ms. Bosold said if we deny this today another submission would have to be substantially different to go back on the agenda.

Ms. Bauman said she would have the ability to go back on the agenda but would have to pay the fees again.

Mr. Morris said continuing to the next meeting will give the applicant more time to provide details.

Ms. Bosold said you might want to talk with some of the neighbors.

Alice Allen said some of the structures you see were built prior to the establishment of the HPC. She noted that a room full of dissidents could not sway her decisions.

Ms. Tiedeman said she is willing to wait 30 days to get this new design reviewed, but if they will not consider a 2 story she needs to know.

Ms. Allen said she does not know how she feels about this design until there is time to review it.

Motion

Donna Bosold motioned to continue this application to the August 6th, 2018 meeting. Kate Deloach seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion carried unanimously

Mr. Howe wanted to speak.

Peter Morris reminded John Howe that any testimony must pertain to the scope of the motion.

Mr. Howe asked if his petition would be part of the record.

Mr. Morris said it will be included in the file.

Other Business:

Discussion on the recommendations from the Monroe County Survey Update Report

Discussion is to be continued when the full Commission is present.

Adjournment.

As there was no other business, Donna Bosold motioned to adjourn. Kate Deloach seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion carried unanimously