

# HPC

## Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission MINUTES

Monday March 2, 2020

Tavernier Fire House, 151 Marine Ave., Tavernier



### 2:00 PM Regular Meeting:

#### **Call to Order.**

#### **Roll Call.**

Present and answering to roll call were Chair-Commissioner Alice Allen, Commissioner Bert Bender, Commissioner Donna Bosold, and Commissioner Brian Shea. Commissioner Kate Deloach was absent.

#### Staff present:

Devin Tolpin, Senior Planner  
Peter Morris, Assistant County Attorney  
Diane Silvia, Preservationist

#### **Adoption of the Minutes from the September 9, 2019 meeting.**

A quorum from the September 9, 2019 meeting was not present so approval of the minutes was continued to the April 6, 2020 meeting.

#### **Changes to the Agenda.**

Bert Bender declared a conflict of interest for Item 5 regarding East Upper Martello Tower in Key West, as his company provides architectural services for the owner.

#### **Applications for Special Certificate of Appropriateness**

**1. Nathan Ramassini (File No. 2020-004)** is proposing to replace existing roofing with 5 V-Crimp metal roofing and replace windows and sliding doors with impact windows and doors at 264 Lincoln Avenue, within the Tavernier Historic District, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00478250-000000 and legally described as:

Lot 11, Block 10, Largo Beach, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 1, at Page 108, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida.

#### **Staff presentation and recommendation**

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

#### **Applicant presentation**

Nathan Ramassini had nothing further to add.

**Public testimony**

There was no public testimony.

**Board discussion**

There was no board discussion.

**Motion**

Bert Bender motioned to approve the project as planned. Donna Bosold seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

**2. Stephen R. Murray (File No. 2020-005)** is proposing to replace the existing asphalt shingle roof with silver mill finish standing seam metal roofing at 126 Coconut Row, within the Tavernier Historic District, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00477370-000000 and legally described as:

Lot 1 and the Northwesterly 25 feet of Lot 2, Block 3, LARGO BEACH, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 1, at Page 108, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida.

**Staff presentation and recommendation**

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

**Applicant presentation**

No one was there to represent the project.

**Public testimony**

Jamie Engle, resident at 138 Oceanview Drive, said the project should be approved.

**Board discussion**

There was no board discussion.

**Motion**

Brian Shea motioned to approve the project as planned. Bert Bender seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

**3. Francois Codrons (File No. 2020-007)** is proposing to remove the existing fencing and replace it with 137 linear feet of 4' wood fencing along the west side of the property and 59 linear feet of 4' wooden fencing along the north side of the property including two entry gates and one double swing gate at 180 Lowe Street, within the Tavernier Historic District, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00566280-000000 and legally described as:

Lot 1, Block 2, TAVERNIER BEACH AMENDED PLAT, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 1, at Page 201, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida.

**Staff presentation and recommendation**

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

### **Applicant presentation**

Krissy Bohnstedt, agent for the owner, explained the proposed fence will be the same as the one that exists now except for the decorative top.

### **Public testimony**

There was no public testimony.

### **Board discussion**

Alice Allen asked if the fence was going to be painted.

Krissy Bohnstedt said no, they are leaving it natural.

Bert Bender asked it was going to have a picket or a flat top.

Ms. Bohnstedt said it would be flat.

Mr. Bender asked if there was a reason they did not want a picket top. The diagram shows a French Gothic style. He asked if the pickets would be spaced.

Ms. Bohnstedt said she spoke with the contractor and that style is not available. The existing fence is board to board.

### **Motion**

Bert Bender motioned to approve the project as planned. Brian Shea seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

**4. Harold McMahon (File No. 2020-010)** is proposing to change the scope of work for a previously approved pool and addition by replacing the wood deck under the existing chickee with pavers to match the pool deck, adding pavers at the landing of the new stairs on the north side of the property and decreasing the SE section of raised patio by 12” at 197 Lowe Street, within the Tavernier Historic District, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00566370-000000 and legally described as:

All of Block 5, less the West 71 feet of AMENDED PLAT OF TAVERNIER BEACH, a subdivision in Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 1, Page 201, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida.

AND

A parcel of filled sovereignty land in Tavernier Harbor abutting Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, said parcel being more particularly described as follows:

Commence at the Northwest corner of Block 5, Amended plat of Tavernier Beach as recorded in Plat Book 1, Page 201 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida; thence Easterly 312 feet along the North line of said Block 5 to its intersection with the Mean High Water Line as shown on said Amended Plat and the Point of Beginning; thence continue Easterly 10 feet along said

North line of Block 5 extended; then South 6 degrees 15 minutes East 44.49 feet; thence South 23 degrees 12 minutes East 30.46 feet; thence South 85 degrees 52 minutes 45 seconds East 69.60 feet; to an Easterly extension of a line 23 feet North of and parallel to the South line of said Block 5; thence Westerly 96 feet along said Easterly extension to the Mean High Water Line as shown on Amended Plat of Tavernier Beach; thence Northerly 75 feet to the Point of Beginning.

AND

A parcel of submerged land in the Straits of Florida in Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, more particularly described as follows:

Beginning at an iron bolt on the shore of the Atlantic Ocean at the mean high tide line and on the dividing line between Block 5 and Lowe Street, all as shown on the Amended Plat of Tavernier Beach, according to Plat Book 1, Page 201, Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, and run South 84 degrees 43 minutes East on the Easterly prolongation of said dividing line a distance of 200 feet; thence North 5 degrees 17 minutes East, a distance of 23 feet; thence North 84 degrees 43 minutes West, a distance of 200 feet; thence North 84 degrees 43 minutes West, a distance of 200 feet to the said mean high tide line; then South along said mean high tide line a distance of 23 feet to the Point of Beginning.

#### **Staff presentation and recommendation**

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

#### **Applicant presentation**

Charles Schafstall, agent for the owner, had nothing further to add.

#### **Public testimony**

There was no public testimony.

#### **Board discussion**

There was no board discussion.

#### **Motion**

Donna Bosold motioned to approve the project as planned. Bert Bender seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

**5. MONROE COUNTY BOCC (File No. 2020-025)** is proposing new sitework at the existing vacant lot at the east side of the East Martello Fort to include: removing the existing landscaping; grading lot and installing swales; installing new native landscaping; new site lighting; new site irrigation; new metal fencing around the lot; and a new wood electrical platform at the rear of the site to elevate the existing electrical panels at KW East Upper Martello Tower located at 3501 South Roosevelt Boulevard on the Island of Key West, Monroe County, Florida OR62-371-376 having Real Estate Number: 00064840-000000 and legally described as:

#### **EAST MARTELLO BATTERY SITE**

A parcel of land located in Section 4, Township 68 South, Range 25 East, on the island of Key

West, Monroe County, Florida and being more particularly described as follows: **COMMENCE** at the Northwest corner of the United States Government East Martello Tower Military Reservation as shown on a map recorded in Plat Book 1 at Page 31 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida and said point also being the Southwest corner of Lot 11, Block 2, "RESUBDIVISION OF BLOCK 2, KEY ESTATES", according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 3, at page 101 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida: **THENCE** N 77°35'02" E along the Southerly Line of said "RESUBDIVISION OF BLOCK 2, KEY ESTATES", for 682.99 feet to the **POINT OF BEGINNING**;

**THENCE** S 12°28'00" E, and leaving the said Southerly Line of Key Estates a distance of 432.00 feet;

**THENCE** N 77°32'00" E, a distance of 530.00 feet;

**THENCE** S 12°28'00" E, a distance of 668.00 feet;

**THENCE** N 79°51'00" E, a distance of 1352.60 feet;

**THENCE** N 01°45'00" W, a distance of 631.97 feet to the Southerly Line of a 50 foot wide easement;

**THENCE** meander the said Southerly Line of the easement for the following twelve (12) metes and bounds;

**THENCE** S 89°30'10" W, a distance of 335.85 feet;

**THENCE** N 88°58'38" W, a distance of 204.30 feet to the point of curvature of a curve to the left, having: a radius of 475.00 feet, a central angle of 17°32'43", a chord bearing of S 82°15'00" W and a chord length of 144.89 feet;

**THENCE** along the arc of said curve, an arc length of 145.46 feet to the point of tangency of said curve;

**THENCE** S 73°28'38" W, a distance of 124.00 feet to the point of curvature of a curve to the right, having: a radius of 225.00 feet, a central angle of 10°37'07", a chord bearing of S 78°47'12" W and a chord length of 41.64 feet;

**THENCE** along the arc of said curve, an arc length of 41.70 feet to the point of tangency of said curve;

**THENCE** S 84°05'45" W, a distance of 122.92 feet;

**THENCE** S 81°53'40" W, a distance of 236.06 feet to a point on a curve to the right, having: a radius of 1025.00 feet, a central angle of 17°26'59", a chord bearing of N 89°22'51" W and a chord length of 310.96 feet;

**THENCE** along the arc of said curve, an arc length of 312.17 feet to the point of tangency of said curve;

**THENCE** N 80°39'21" W, a distance of 56.37 feet to the point of curvature of a curve to the right, having: a radius of 425.00 feet, a central angle of 20°39'05"; a chord bearing of N 70°19'49" W and a chord length of 152.36 feet;

**THENCE** along the arc of said curve, an arc length of 153.18 feet to the point of tangency of said curve;

**THENCE** N 60°00'17" W, a distance of 288.91 feet;

**THENCE** N 23°06'58" W, a distance of 13.06 feet;

**THENCE** S 77°35'02" W, and along a portion of the Southerly Line of said plat of Key Estates a distance of 104.80 feet to the **POINT OF BEGINNING**.

Parcel contains 1,153,719 square feet or 26.49 acres more or less.

**Bert Bender had recused himself and left the room.**

**Staff presentation and recommendation**

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

**Applicant presentation**

David Salay, Architect for the owner, had nothing further to add.

**Public testimony**

There was no public testimony.

**Board discussion**

Donna Bosold explained that archaeological monitoring is a must at this nationally significant site. She is excited to see this project happening.

Brian Shea asked that the stairway to the platform be screened from view.

Alice Allen asked if they needed to include archaeological monitoring as a condition of the approval.

Peter Morris said this is an aspirational recommendation that does not have to be complied with if there is no basis in the guidelines. It does not have to be in the motion but should be included in the resolution.

Donna Bosold said she does not agree. There is a basis in the guidelines and on top of that this is a National Register site.

Diane Silvia said this requirement is not based on the Tavernier Guidelines; it is Standard 8 of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

**Motion**

Dona Bosold motioned to approve the project as planned subject to Standard 8 of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation requiring archaeological monitoring. Brian Shea seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

**6. Laura Frank and Calla Frank (File No. 2020-028)** are proposing to add a 12' X 34' open deck to the existing 2' wrap around walkway at the rear and add hand rails on the east, west, and north side of the home to tie into the existing front deck and railings at 228 Ocean Boulevard, within the Tavernier Historic District, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00477500-000000 and legally described as:

Lot 3, Block 4, Largo Beach, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 1, at Page 108, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida.

**Staff presentation and recommendation**

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

**Applicant presentation**

Calla Frank had nothing further to add.

**Public testimony**

There was no public testimony.

**Staff response**

Devin Tolpin explained a two foot portion of the deck at the northwest corner would extend into the required primary 10 foot side setback and would most likely require a variance. The applicant has been informed.

**Board discussion**

Donna Bosold asked if they wanted the HPC to decide today so they do not have to come back to us.

Devin Tolpin said she believes that is the intent.

**Motion**

Donna Bosold motioned to approve the project as planned and also if they must reduce the deck size to avoid a variance. They do not have to come back to the HPC for this change. Brian Shea seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

**Other Business:**

Diane Silvia explained that the National Marine Sanctuary was soliciting comment from the HPC about the proposed programmatic agreement regarding the management and permitting regarding submerged cultural resources. She explained the agreement calls for simplifying the permitting process so that only one permit would be needed instead of two and that new salvage activity would be limited or eliminated. Brian Shea said the email gave a deadline for these comments of March 10<sup>th</sup>.

The HPC Commissioners agreed they wanted more time to look into this and would get back to Diane with their individual comments.

**Adjournment.**

Bert Bender motioned to adjourn. Alice Allen seconded the motion.